

# Minerva Humanities Center, Tel-Aviv University

## Annual Academic Report 2017–18

---

### Contact Information

Minerva Humanities Center

Website (English): <http://mhc.tau.ac.il/en>

Tel. +972-3-6405764

Location: Tel-Aviv University, Rosenberg Building, Rooms 213, 407

---

### International Scientific Board

Prof. Dr. Jürgen Renn, Max Planck Institute for History of Science, Berlin, Germany (Chair)

Prof. Dr. Gerd Graßhoff, Professor for History of Ancient Science, Humboldt University, Berlin, Germany

Prof. Dr. Kostas Gavroglu, Department of History and Philosophy of Science, Athens University, Athens, Greece

Prof. Dr. Yaron Ezrahi (Emeritus), Hebrew University, Jerusalem, Israel

Prof. Dr. Ora Limor, Open University, Raanana, Israel

---

### Management and Administration

**Academic Directors:** Prof. Dr. Rivka Feldhay  
Dr. Ariel Handel  
Dr. Raef Zreik

**Executive Director:** Ms. Yulie Litov

**Secretary:** Ms. Anat Zion

**Departmental Coordinators:** Dr. Ran Segev  
Dr. Chen Misgav  
Ms. Avital Barak

## A. Research Groups

---

### 1. Migrating Knowledge

This research group examines practices of knowledge production and distribution that promote or constrain the diffusion of knowledge. By studying the epistemic, social and institutional structures within which knowledge is being produced, we shed light on the contexts that determine the specific boundaries within which science is mobilized.

It is not until recently that scholars have called into question the grand narrative according to which Western science went through a linear progress that can be traced back to early modernity. The 'Migrating Knowledge' research group draws on these trends, and seeks to further problematize the dichotomies between center and periphery, and between theoretical and practical knowledge. We therefore reject the view of knowledge as a pure product of human intellect. Instead, we aim to bring out the political nature of the contents and the infrastructures that have been assigned to knowledge production in the discourse on modernity.

During the last two years, our research has focused on themes of knowledge transmission in conflict zones. In this context, we underlined the importance of social and intellectual networks which operate as intermediaries in areas of socio-political fragmentation. We have discussed the ways in which the distribution of ideas, information, technologies and material culture shape national and cultural boundaries, as well as the impact of conflicts on the creation and exchange of knowledge and technologies. We also continued to explore the application of theoretical and practical methods to new cultural settings, and the manner in which such methods are used and abused as means to political ends.

Drawing on the work of philosopher Karl Jaspers and sociologist of knowledge S. N. Eisenstadt, we have discussed the notion of "civilizations of knowledge". Despite its abuse in popular and academic literature, we have evaluated whether the term "civilization" can be used to shed light on the roles which metaphysical and transcendental notions play in the formation and organization of knowledge. In particular, we considered the possibility of using this notion for developing an alternative understanding of Islamic scientific culture in modernity, that overcomes and avoids the dichotomy between progress and decline.

## Meetings

### ***31.10.2017: Tal Arbel***

Dr. Arbel's lecture examined the first sociological research on the Kibbutz movement, undertaken by Siegfried Landshut (*Ha'kvuzta*, 1944). The lecture presented the institutional and political circumstances that shaped Landshut's study, as well as its reception among scholars and Kibbutz members. The history of Landshut's work, Arbel's talk suggested, reveals the contribution of immigrants and central-European refugees to scientific practices in the interwar period, and in particular, their contribution to the dissemination of modern social theory in Israel's pre-state era.

### ***5.12.2017: Yoav Meyrav***

Dr. Meyrav's lecture presented Themistius' Paraphrase of Aristotle's *Metaphysics*, Book XII. This intricate text was originally written in Greek, but survived only in its Hebrew and partial-Arabic translation. The talk focused on Themistius' attempt to tackle a central issues in Islamic and Jewish medieval philosophy, namely, the relationship between nature and the metaphysical world. Using philological tools, Meyrav reconstructed Themistius' philosophical system and argued that inaccurate translations of Themistius' Paraphrase (first from Greek to Arabic, and then from Arabic to Hebrew) contributed to common misunderstandings of Themistius' ideas.

### ***16.1.2018: Jonathan Rubin***

The Latin Kingdom of Jerusalem founded in 1099 was ethnically, religiously, and linguistically diverse. Its establishment after the First Crusade further increased the contacts between Latin Europe and Muslims and Eastern Christians groups in the southern Levant. Dr. Rubin's lecture raised a set of interrelated questions: to what extent did the Latin kingdom facilitate the intercultural exchange of scientific knowledge? Did European settlers attempt to study the world of Islam and Islamic theology in particular? Did the kingdom take part in the intellectual developments that characterize contemporary Catholic Europe? To what extent can we see the transmission of knowledge from the Latin East to Europe? Rubin presented the intellectual activities in the "Crusader State" in fields such as geography and botany. He argued that the kingdom was as a center of knowledge migration in the Eastern Mediterranean.

### ***13.3.2018: Daniel Strassberg***

In his talk, Prof. Strassberg suggested that machines embody knowledge which can radically reorganize our understanding of the world, once made explicit. As an example, he showed how the steam engine has led to a radical change in our concept of life.

**27.3.2018: Ronnie Mirkin**

Dr. Mirkin's lecture focused on the connections between gender, clothing and fashion, by way of examining intercultural exchange in the southern Levant during the crusades. She studies the appearance of Latin women in visual and textual sources in order to reveal the transmission of material culture between East and West. In her talk, Dr. Mirkin argued that from the depiction of Latin women in contemporary sources we can learn more about European imaginative perceptions than we can learn about Latin women. Rather than emphasizing the masculine point of view on the crusades, Dr. Mirkin offered an alternative account that stresses the role of women in the crusade movement and in cultural production within it.

**May 1, 2018: Mònica Colominas Aparicio**

Dr. Colominas Aparicio's lecture examined the boundaries between religious groups in the late medieval Iberian Peninsula. Knowledge of Islam was progressively compromised by the restrictions on the Muslim minorities of Christian Spain. These restrictions paralleled those imposed on the Jews. Against this background, Muslim religious leaders felt they needed to reach broad audiences. The diversification of knowledge brought about by the principle of *docere et delectare* (which translates as 'to teach and delight') was an important means to do this, helping to spread knowledge among the various layers of Muslim society, and to strengthen the sense of belonging to the umma (which translates as 'community'). It also functioned as an effective means to draw community boundaries.

**Workshops and Conferences*****Civilizations of Knowledge***

The first two days of the conference were held at Tel Aviv University (11-12.6.2018), as an international academic workshop, in collaboration with the Cohn institute. On the third day (13.6), a second part of the event was held at the Nazareth Culture Center, in cooperation with Polyphony Foundation and Saint Joseph High school. Our aim in this conference was to approach what we call *Civilizations of Knowledge* from a perspective that emphasizes their being ridden with dialectical, generative tensions, often both fruitful and destructive. Such an approach seeks to distance itself from linear narratives on which scientific modern Enlightenment has progressed and evolved from the obscurantism of religion, as well as from narratives of decline, often used to account for the condition of Islamic scientific culture in modernity. Civilizations ridden with dialectical tensions have given rise to contradictory tendencies: cognitive achievements, cultural refinement and controlled experimenting on the one hand, and power struggles, clashes of authority, and attempts to suppress and dominate others, on the other hand .

For this academic conference, we invited studies about the ways in which transcendental, metaphysical, and theological principles were embroiled in processes of political structuration and the formation of knowledge paradigms, regarding both nature and humans. We also encouraged scholars from different academic fields to participate in discussions about the possible use and abuse of the framework of "civilizations of knowledge", and to evaluate to what extent this framework may be conducive to our research.

\* See conference program attached.

*Spiritual Practices: Between Subject Constitution, Modern Sovereignty and Care of the Self*

This workshop took place at The Van Leer Jerusalem Institute (24.4.18). It dealt with the relationship between spiritual practices, sovereignty, and the self in early and late modernity, from several perspectives. The guiding thread for the workshop was Michel de Certeau's assertion that the rise of spiritual practices in the 17<sup>th</sup> century was a reaction to the rise of the modern sovereign state and its institutions. According to Certeau, spiritual "withdrawal" is a medium for the transformation of the believer as a modern subject. The discussions linked Certeau's observation to reflections on the connection between spiritual practices and modernity found in the works of other prominent thinkers such as Foucault, Benjamin, and Derrida. Key speakers were Professor Arnold Davidson from the University of Chicago, and Professor (emeritus) Guy Strumisa from the Hebrew University.

*Rivka Feldhay, Israel Science Foundation Project, Disciplinarization of the Sciences: Pre-Classical Mechanics between the Sovereign State and the Reformed Catholic Religion, 1550-1650*

The study will focus on the emergence of an early modern political-religious constellation in the Catholic world between 1550 and 1650, and the place of pre-classical mechanics within this context. We shall argue that the Protestant and Catholic reformations and the religious wars led to a reconstitution of Christian religious communities not merely as a reaction to, but also as a function of **the newly emerging sovereign states**.

In our study, we shall show how new types of scientific and artistic practices, relevant to both the state and to religion, came to constitute the disciplinary core of Western modern science. In analyzing the re-configuration of the state-religion-science complex during the said period, we shall thus portray, in very broad strokes, the Catholic path to modernity not only in terms of conflict and differentiation from science and the state, but also in terms of the powers that served to consolidate a common framework.

The project consists of three parts, each organized around one theme that throws

light on the structure of the whole, and on the interconnections between the themes. The themes are the sovereign state, the reformed Catholic religion, and pre-classical mechanics, which is at the heart of the new science emerging in the 17<sup>th</sup> century. The project will be conducted over a period of three years, in collaboration with Dr. Michael Elazar and Dr. Ivor Ludlam, fellows at Minerva Humanities Center.

### *'Tradition: Canon, Transmission, Critique'*

This research group, led by Dr. Lina Barouch and Dr. Ori Rotlevy (who replaced Dr. Vered Sakal), is part of the 'Migrating Knowledge' project. It explores the notion of tradition from a theoretical perspective and through its concrete implementations in the domains of religion, science and art. In continuation with its activities in the academic years 2016-2017, during this last academic year the group has held four joint reading sessions. These sessions have examined the relations between tradition, memory, and language, in the spheres of philosophy, literary criticism, and psychoanalysis.

The first session (28.3.18) was dedicated to Alasdair MacIntyre's claim that philosophy refuses to acknowledge its own tradition; the second one (25.4.18) was dedicated to the problem of transmissibility in modernity, according to Walter Benjamin's discussion of Kafka; the third session (23.5.18) took up the latent tradition Sigmund Freud draws from the linguistic medium in his *Moses and Monotheism*, and the affinities between this text and Else Lasker Schüller's writings; the final session (27.6.18) was concerned with the notion of cities of refuge, as it appears in Jewish tradition broadly-construed, including the Talmud, S.Y. Agnon, and George Perec. These sessions, directed by Dr. Rotlevy, Dr. Omer Michaelis, Dr. Lina Barouch and Adi Sorek, respectively, consisted in discussions both about the writings under considerations, and about related research projects conducted by the group's members. The group plans to continue with similar activities during the coming academic year.

### *PhD and Post-Doctoral Students*

#### *Chen Earon (Phd Student)*

What happens when ethical justifications for an economic policy are forgotten, but the policy lives on? What happens when this policy and its outcomes acquire a different set of ethical justifications? How will this new situation affect the normative, political or economic considerations of decision makers? Earon's research deals with these questions through a case study of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR). He criticizes the common justifications for CSR, which appeal to the work of Adam Smith, arguing that the actual ethical justifications given by Smith to the

free market economy are inconsistent with justifications for CSR given by modern economists and businessmen. Moreover, he investigates whether the idea of a free market economy can be justified on grounds other than the ethical grounds that served to justify it in the past. In light of these issues, in the framework of the *Migrating Knowledge* research group, Earon has discussed the question of whether Smith's work, stripped of its original ethical meaning throughout the years, can remain canonical.

***Dr. Tal Arbel***

Dr. Arbel is a historian of modern science and technology. In May 2016, she completed her Ph.D. in History of Science at Harvard University. During her tenure as a postdoctoral fellow at the Minerva Center (October 2016 – September 2018), Arbel has been working on two articles dealing with different dimensions of knowledge migration in the social and mind sciences. The first, "Fear in Hebrew," examined Hebrew translations of WWII-era professional handbooks for soldiers on the psychology of war. The second article is part of a larger project on the role that Weimar-era Jewish scholars played in the canonization of modern social theory. It tells the story of exiled Weberian sociologist Siegfried Landshut and his 1944 study *HaKvutza*, the first scientific work on the kibbutz. Both articles are due in print by the end of 2018. Arbel is currently working on a new book-long project that draws on her expertise in the history of postwar American science and the global and international history of the Twentieth century. Her proposal, "Polling for Peace: Survey Measurement and the Postwar International Order" has won the 2018 Dan David Prize for young scholars.

***Dr. Ran Segev***

Dr. Segev is a historian of the early modern period, whose interests include religious culture, colonial encounters, and the interplay of science and religion, especially as they pertain to the Spanish world. He graduated from the department of history at the University of Texas, Austin in December 2015, where he wrote his doctoral thesis *The Science of Faith: Religious Worldviews and the Study of Nature in the Spanish World, 1530s-1640s*. He is currently working on his forthcoming book, which explores the importance of the study of the earth in Spain and its colonies for confessional ends. In this monograph, he shows how in the post-Reformation world, new empirical knowledge and natural disciplines, including geographies, cosmographies and natural histories, were assimilated into Catholic outlooks by providing new ways for conceptualizing and transmitting religious ideologies. He is also working on a new research project, *Ethnography and Comparative Religion in the Early Modern Atlantic*, which examines ethnographic practices in pre-modern period. In the academic year 2017-2018, Ran was awarded a post-

doctoral fellowship from the Zvi Yavetz School of History, a research fellowship at the Max Planck Institute for the History of Science in Berlin and a Dan David Prize for young scholars.

## 2. Political Lexicon

The Political Lexicon department, led by Dr. Ariel Handel, is both a research group studying foundational concepts in political theory, and the primary venue for initiating, writing, editing, and assembling original essays for the Lexicon for Political Concepts, published in the online peer-reviewed academic journal *Mafte'akh*. Our work systematically cuts across institutional and disciplinary boundaries and does not shy away from interacting with extra-academic sources of knowledge, such as the arts and social activism. It is guided and integrated by a return to the ancient philosophical endeavor of answering questions of the form "What is X?". The attempt to answer questions of this abstract form are aimed at examining the common usage of concepts as well as their proper theoretical frameworks. With each critical examination of a concept, new opportunities arise for invigorating the arsenal and broadening the theoretical horizons of the Humanities. By criticizing and scrutinizing our contemporary political vocabulary, we are able to release the practical potential of political theory, and to shed new light on some aspects of political reality which the concepts under examination seek to capture. Within the department, three reading groups have operated bi-weekly or monthly. *Political Theory*, the project's core group, led by Dr. Ariel Handel; *Photo-Lexic*, led by Dr. Ruthie Ginsburg; and *Education & Politics*, led by Dr. Itay Snir and Mr. Adam Aboulafia. These reading groups strive to cultivate a community of scholars—including faculty, graduate and postgraduate students—committed to a critical approach to political theory and a political approach to theory in the humanities.

### *Lexical event and screening of the documentary film 'Looted and Hidden' (March, 2018)*

This academic event included a screening of the documentary film *Looted and Hidden*, followed by a panel with three lexical lectures pertinent to the film: "Security" by Sarai Aharoni from Ben-Gurion University, "Archive" by Ruth Presser from Haifa University, and "Memory" by Mara'm Maasrawa from Tel Aviv University. The film *Looted and Hidden* deals with Palestinian archives that were looted or seized by Israel or Jewish forces during the 20<sup>th</sup> century, and are currently held in Israeli military archives. Based on a lengthy struggle to get access to classified materials, archival footage that were considered lost, and interviews with archive workers and with soldiers that seized Palestinian archives, the film focuses on the

treasures Israel looted in Beirut in the 1980s. It unravels the fate of Palestinian archives, especially film and visual archives, that documented the Palestinian Revolution from late 1960s to the beginning of the 1980s. Raising questions about archival institutions in colonial countries and conflict zones, the film demonstrates the importance of unraveling hidden historical documents in order to bring to light that which has been concealed, erased or rewritten.

***Annual Theme and Lexical Workshop:  
'Knowledge and Action: Political Concepts of Protest'***

This year's annual theme and lexical workshop are the products of a collaborative effort of the Lexicon for Political Theory and the Van Leer Jerusalem Institute. The readings and discussions focused on the relationship between technology, politics, and alternative knowledge.

As humans, we act in the world and understand it through 'mediators' such as language, technologies, and various instruments. These mediators and our interactions with them give rise different kinds of knowledge. Technology's combination of knowledge, representation, and action, allows it to reproduce and consolidate power relations and social distinctions. But technology could also challenge, dismantle and subvert those very power relations and social distinctions. Technology's role in politics is often understood according to a "top-down" model, focusing on its role in surveillance and control apparatuses. This model leads to neglecting the ways in which technology, instruments, and nonhumans in general, are involved in activism, public art, and alternative mapping, as well as the way they undermine our understanding of concepts such as citizenship, production, community, commons, and others. Our main endeavor this year was therefore to critically analyze the role that technologies play in protest and activism, and in creating "bottom-up" knowledge, i.e. a civilian, alternative knowledge, that produces and preserves a public space, thereby producing "power" in its Arendtian sense of collective human action.

The outcomes of our work during the last academic year was a workshop, that was also attended by scholars who are not members of the group. Twelve papers were presented in the workshop, which took place at the Van Leer Jerusalem Institute in early May, 2018. The participants presented various concepts, including "Document", "Alternative Media", "Ceremonial Protest", "Mizrahi Feminism", "Resistance in Movement", "Table", "Quantitative Activism", "Participatory Surveillance", "Political Disruption", "Building Criticism", "Civil Science", and "Counter-Mapping". Some of these lecture will be selected and revised for publication in a special issue of *Mafte'akh*, that will be edited by two scholars from the group.

### ***The 15th Lexical Conference for Critical Political Thought (May 2018)***

The presentations in this conference aimed, like those presented in previous conferences, to contribute to an alternative political lexicon that draws on or is inspired by various recent trends in continental philosophy and critical theory.

The conference consisted of five sessions, and included presentations of concepts such as "Margins", "Iron Dome", "Naming", "Gender Measure", "Feminist Pedagogy", "First Generation", "Subversive Hope", "Feeding", "Love", "Memory", "Monument", "Childhood", "Politicide", and "Return". The conference, held in Tel Aviv University, brought together many scholars from different disciplines within the social sciences and the humanities, members of the Political Lexicon Group and others.

### ***Maft'e'akh: A Lexical Review of Political Thought***

The journal *Maft'e'akh: A Lexical Review of Political Thought* is now in its eighth year of open-access online publication. Our editor-in-chief, Dr. Yoav Kenny, was replaced by Dr. Merav Amir, Dr. Ruthie Ginsburg and Dr. Itay Snir, who will co-edit the journal.

In 2018, the journal published its 12<sup>th</sup> issue, a special issue of the *PhotoLexic Group*. The *PhotoLexic Group* consists of photography theorists and practitioners operating under the auspices of the *Political Lexicon Group*. The authors who have contributed to this issue are all members of the *PhotoLexic Group*. The issue was published in January 2018, and was co-edited by Dr. Ruthie Ginsburg, director of the *PhotoLexic Group*, and Dr. Yoav Kenny. The issue includes eight original lexical articles: "Pre-State Archive", "Camouflage", "Window", "Table of Testimony", "Speed", "Pedagogical Activist Photography", "Citizens' Photography" and "See and Spot", as well as an introduction by Dr. Ginsburg.

Work on issue 13, due to appear in September 2018, is already in progress. It will include articles on the concepts "Intellectual", "Care of the Self", "Tribal Liberalism", "Populism", "Colonial Imitation", and "Political". Two additional articles, "Childhood" and "Resistance", are still under review. We also hope to be able to provide a translation of Michael Warner's article "Publics and Counterpublics".

Issue 14 is forthcoming in 2019 (guest co-editor: Dr. Assaf Tamari), and will consist of papers based on presentations in an outstanding workshop on Jewish political concepts. This workshop, titled "Beyond the Horizon of Secularization", took place in May 2018, and was the result of a successful collaboration with the Van Leer Jerusalem Institute.

### *Citizens' Photography: Knowledge Production in the Field of Human Rights*

This research project focuses on visual knowledge production in the field of human rights, with particular attention given to citizens' photography, and to knowledge produced by non-professionals in the field of human rights, based on political expertise. The research is funded by the Fritz Thyssen Foundation, and is implemented at the Minerva Humanities Center by Dr. Ruthie Ginsburg, who supervises the project.

Both globally and locally, human rights are currently the main political framework for individuals and groups struggling for justice. As opposed to traditional political practice that aims to gain public support by appealing to a non-professionalized popular discourse, human rights politics strives to sway public opinion by expert knowledge. Major technological developments, such as digital photography and the internet, have brought about a significant change in the mode of producing and collecting knowledge on human rights violations. In the last two decades in particular, evidence on human rights violations has been increasingly produced by non-professionals. Such evidence is often gathered by citizens who are part of the afflicted community, rather than by a third party such as human rights professionals or photojournalists. This mode of knowledge production has led to new networks and collaborations that affect the structure and modus operandi of human rights organizations.

The case study of this research is the *Camera Project* of the Israeli human rights organization B'Tselem, which operates in the Occupied Palestinian Territories (OPT). The case study involves comparing the Camera Project to similar citizens' photography projects around the world. In order to gain better understanding of citizens' photography as a mode of knowledge production in the field of human rights, several interviews were held over the past months: five with Palestinians who participate in the Camera Project and live in Hebron (al-Khalil) and Nabi Salih, a Palestinian village in the West Bank, and five others with B'Tselem employees, one of whom is the new director of the *Camera Project*.

The intricate relations and collaborations between the non-professional citizens and human rights experts were further examined by means of archive research and comparisons between the B'Tselem's YouTube channel and Palestinian channels, such as the Tamimi family YouTube channel. Ahed Tamimi was sentenced for eight months in Israeli prison for slapping an IDF soldier. Her family's YouTube channel documents Nabi Salih's ongoing struggle against the occupation.

### *Publications*

Two papers based on the group's work have been published this year; one is 'revise and resubmit' status; another has been submitted for publication. In addition, work on another paper and a book based on the products of this research group is in progress.

- "Citizens' Photography: A Comparative Analysis": this paper was published in *Maft'e'akh*. It is a comparative analysis of citizens' photography in the spheres of media (journalism in particular), the social sciences, and human rights organizations. The paper examines the role of citizens' photography in those fields, as well as its complicated relationship with experts in each field. It also includes a comprehensive review of the literature on the subject that sheds light on the historical emergence of the practice, its strengths and weaknesses. While most scholars limit their examination of citizens' photography to a single, isolated field of knowledge, this article seeks to understand its centrality for a civil politics of visual participation by comparing the ways it functions in different fields. The article shows that recent developments in digital and information technology enable non-professionals to produce knowledge. Citizens' photography therefore holds a promise of democratization, but also a threat of failing to live up to this promise, as it enables citizens to take production and distribution of information into their own hands.
- "Gendered Visual Activism: Documenting Human Rights Abuse from the Private Sphere", published in the peer-reviewed official journal of the International Sociological Association, *Current Sociology*. This paper discusses the spatialization of Palestinian women's participation in the *Camera Project*. The main argument presented here is that the domestic space from which Palestinian women document human rights violations that occur outside their homes is a site of anti-colonial struggle, and that this newly-developed practice benefits from the intersection of a specific sociopolitical situation with techno-ethical developments.
- "Emancipation and Collaboration: A Critical Examination of Human Rights Video Advocacy": this paper is in 'revise and resubmit' status in the highly-ranked peer-reviewed journal *Theory, Culture, & Society*. It explores the relationship between political freedom and collaboration in the work of human rights organizations. This exploration focuses on the ethical and political implications of producing evidence, once the documenting tool, the camera, is in the hands of an engaged civilian rather than a professional bystander such as a photojournalist. By examining cases in the OPT where

Palestinians are the photographers, this examination outlines the relations and tensions between emancipatory acts and collaboration via visual information production. While both human rights organizations and non-professional Palestinian photographers celebrate the collaboration in knowledge production as empowering, this phenomenon has negative political effects as well, such as limiting its political impact to the Israeli public.

- "Armed with a Camera: Human Rights Documentation, Gender, the Case of Israel/Palestine": work on this paper is still in progress. This article deals with women's agency in a conflict zone. Their participation in visual documentation is portrayed by B'Tselem in the context of their precarious position, as victims of a double oppression as Palestinians under occupation and as women. It offers a critical perspective on B'Tselem's portrayal of Palestinian women's participation in the *Camera Project*. International law and human rights organizations tend to emphasize the protection of women, children and elders in a state of war, who are often considered the paradigmatic civil society, and to neglect the protection of unarmed men. Against this background, this paper asks whether we can see gender differences in the visual documentation produced in the *Camera Project*.
- We are also working on a paper which will be the first major study on non-professional photographers in the OPT. During the First Intifada (1987-1993), a team of filmmakers and journalists initiated a citizen photography project, where they taught three young Palestinians to film and edit. The project was documented in a 60-minute documentary film called *Palestinian Diaries*. The paper in question is based on interviews conducted with the initiators of the project about its aims and effects.

In addition to these papers, we intend to write two chapters for a projected book. The first chapter will deal with photography in the legal sphere, and specifically with the status of citizens' photography as court evidence, as in the recent case of the Israeli soldier Elor Azaria. The second chapter will focus on the changes in human rights knowledge-production, following the advent of citizen photography. It will examine the effects of this practice on the norms and structures of human rights organizations. We are currently searching for a publishing house that will publish the products of these projects in book format.

### ***Critical Perspectives on Academic Professionalization: Workshops for First Generation Academics and Arab Students***

In the academic year 2017-2018, the Minerva Humanities Center held two advanced-

research students workshops. These workshops were aimed at promoting Master's degree-seeking students and PhD candidates in the humanities and social sciences, and at encouraging them at the pursuit of an academic career.

The 'First Generation Academics' workshop was for students whose parents do not hold academic degrees. The workshop for Arab students tackled the problem of educational exclusion and other structural barriers that prevent Arabs from securing positions in Israeli academia. This workshop was in cooperation with Tel Aviv University's "Sawa" (סוּא), the Kahanoff Arab Student Retention Initiative, and the dean of students' office.

Research conducted in Israel and in other countries shows that the percentage of students whose parents do not have academic degrees is significantly lower than the percentage of students who have at least one parent with an academic degree. First-generation students also tend to prefer colleges to universities and to prefer professional programs that are perceived to enable social mobility to pursuing degrees in the humanities and the social sciences. These trends lead to under-representation of first-generation academics among university faculty. Arab students currently comprise only about 4-8 percent of the students who graduate with advanced degrees and a mere 2 percent among academic faculty. Among the factors that have been identified as barriers to Arab students' success in Israeli academia are language, and cultural and peer-group differences.

The workshops focused on academic professionalization skills: reading and writing academic texts (research proposals, dissertations, articles), writing CVs and abstracts, submitting proposals for conferences and research funding, publishing papers, adjunct teaching applications, etc. In addition, it involved reading some critical texts about academia, and exposing students to the structural strengths and weaknesses of the contemporary academic system. Participants also got a chance to meet with senior and junior researchers.

The 'First Generation Academics' workshop also included an intense, six-hour mentoring program. The mentors and tutors are researchers at the Minerva Humanities Center and activists from the 'Academia for Equality' initiative, and they all volunteered to tutor in the program. Some of these volunteers are first-generation academics as well.

Two new small workshops were added this year for students seeking to develop their Hebrew and English writing skills. This workshop first took place in the academic year of 2015-2016, as a pilot project, led by Dr. Roy Wagner and Ms. Revital Madar. From that year on, the workshops have been led by Efrat Ben-Shoshan Gazit, a Ph.D Candidate at the Women and Gender Studies Program at Tel Aviv University.

The workshops served as support groups for the participants, allowing them to discuss their own concerns, experiences and language challenges. Students in

both workshops found them to be valuable and helpful. They reported that they have acquired a better understanding of what is expected of them as researchers, as well as valuable tools for meeting these expectations.

These activities throughout the year also yielded a presentation on the concept of "First Generation", delivered by Dr. Hilla Dayan and Efrat Ben-Shoshan Gazit at the 15th Lexical Conference for Critical Political Thought. This pioneering initiative to promote first-generation academics of this workshop, that has nothing similar to it in Israeli academia, has led to establishing new collaborations for further research on the subject.

### *Education and politics*

Led by Dr. Itay Snir and Mr. Adam Aboulafia, this research group belong to the Political Lexicon Group, and is devoted to a critical examination of the relationship between education and politics, focusing on both conceptual issues in the philosophy of education and analysis of empirical data pertinent to understanding the various links between the political sphere and educational practices and institutions. It is our working hypothesis that de-politicization of education is impossible, and that any talk of it is a political strategy in disguise. We are therefore particularly interested in the various ways in which education is or might be politicized.

Participants in this group are researchers in philosophy (especially philosophy of education), sociology, and law. Many of the participants have also held professional positions within or in close connection with non-academic educational institutions (e.g. high-school teachers, education journalism, and curriculum supervisors in the ministry of education).

Our overarching goal this year was to form a collective research community that would synthesize various theoretical disciplines pertinent to understanding the relation between politics and education, and to apply this interdisciplinary theoretical toolbox to issues encountered in the educational and political practice. We met once a month in the academic years 2016-17 and 2017-18. Each session included a presentation of a theoretical text by one or two of the participants, followed by group discussion.

The discussions this year focused on the relationship between the state and educational institutions. Specifically, we examined the ways in which the state strives to control or regulate these institutions, the more general roles that these institutions play in relation to the goals of the state, and the ways in which educational institutions can become a site for pressure and protest against state policy. Among the particular issues and thinkers discussed were the following: state power and education as a social filtering device, according to sociologist Pierre Bourdieu's late conceptualization; an argument against educational integration from

a leftist perspective, given by the philosopher of education Michael Merry's; critical discussions of prominent ideas such as "education for (democratic) citizenship" and "education for peace"; and empirical surveys of contemporary educational phenomena such as the rise of a religious-liberal Judaism in Israeli educational institutions.

### 3. Living Together

The theme of the group this year was *Justice, Revenge and forgiveness*.

Twelve meetings were held throughout the year. During the first semester we read theoretical texts by various scholars, and examined different paradigms for dealing with the concepts of justice, revenge, and forgiveness, taken together and in separation from one another. During the second semester we focused on several case studies and examined them using the theoretical frameworks dealt with in the first semester.

*Revenge, justice, forgiveness* are three modes of dealing with harms, grievances, or infringements, usually brought about by one person upon another in the private sphere. Such harms, however, can also be inflicted by one group, tribe, or nation upon another, and so these modes of dealing with harm are also applicable to inter-group relations.

**Revenge** designates a wide-host of ways of "getting even", of reprisal, where one person inflicts harm on another person who had harmed her earlier. But unlike justice, revenge is a private initiative. It is not carried out by public institutions, according to an agreed-upon public procedure, and the decision to take revenge cannot be appealed or revised. Revenge is therefore a private way to restore justice, where a victim assumes the position of both judge, prosecutor and executor in his or her own case. The fact that all these legal positions are taken up by the same person who is also an interested party in the case, raises the risk of excess, unjust punishment.

**Justice**, may also be geared to rectifying past harms. It does that, however, by means of legal procedure, and is subjected to known and agreed-upon regulations. The state justice system prohibits individual victims from taking matters into their own hands, and places the authority to punish in the hands of a public institution, be it in criminal or in civil legal cases. In criminal cases, the prosecutor and the judge are public figures, appointed by the state, while in civic justice the prosecutor is a private plaintiff, and only the judge is a public representative of the state.

When it comes to **forgiveness**, we have a major shift in the approach to past harms. Rather than seeking to rectify a past harm by inflicting another one, forgiveness is directed toward the future. It allows us to start something new, turn a new page, and leave the past behind without inflicting further harm. Forgiveness in this sense can be thought as a way to get rid of the grip of the past and letting go.

These conceptions of revenge, justice, and forgiveness provided the starting point for this workshop. Building on these conceptions, we proceeded to explore and develop their implications and interconnections. Starting with revenge, we examined and questioned our initial understanding of the concept, asking questions such as: what makes revenge attractive and desirable, and what makes it obscene and or repulsive? Is revenge necessarily a private initiative of individuals, or can it be carried out by state institutions and be subjected to public rules? Is it necessarily excessive, so that one always gets more than she deserves, or can revenge be proportional and fair? Do we have a duty to ourselves to take revenge, under certain conditions?

We proceeded to discuss the concept of justice, drawing several distinctions between criminal and civil justice, private and criminal law, corrective and distributive justice, and justice and equity. We have then dealt with the role victims play in criminal procedures.

Finally, we discussed some conceptual issues related to forgiveness. The questions discussed included the following: what does forgiveness entail, exactly? What attitude should the victim take toward the aggressor in order to forgive her? Who can forgive? Can we forgive in the name of others? What needs to be done, in order for forgiveness to successfully take place? Is it necessary that the perpetrator ask for forgiveness, in order for it to occur? Is the ability to forgive always a virtue, or can it be a sign of weakness under some conditions (and if so, what are they)? Are some crimes simply unforgivable?

Later on we moved to another set of questions, that dealt with the connections between the concepts: do these concepts converge? Can we have revenge and justice at the same time? Justice and forgiveness at the same time? Or, to further complicate things, can we have revenge and forgiveness at the same time, or do they necessarily exclude one another? How do these concepts relate to concepts such as truth, reconciliation, and peace? Can one lead to the other? Can one come at the expense of other concepts and ideals? How do we make the tradeoffs? The discussion began by considering relations between individuals, but then we also tried to see how far it can be applicable to relations between groups and nations. After this conceptual journey, we moved in the second semester to examining concrete cases pertinent to these questions from history, politics, literature, and cinema. Among those issues were post-Apartheid South Africa, slavery, Israel/Palestine, the Nuremberg Trials, and others. The readings materials included the following:

Charles K. B. Burton, *Getting Even: Revenge as a Form of Justice*, Open Court, 1999.

Charles L. Griswold, *Forgiveness – a philosophical exploration*, Cambridge University Press, 2007.

Friedrich Nietzsche, *On the Genealogy of Morals: A Polemic*, Oxford University Press, 1997.

Hannah Arendt, *The Human Condition*, Chicago University Press, 1998.

Jacques Derrida, *On Cosmopolitanism and Forgiveness*, Routledge, 2001.

During the second semester, members of the group presented a few case studies that were analyzed using the theoretical background of the first semester:

**Gal Hertz** presented the short story *Earthquake in Chile*, by Heinrich von Kleist (1807). The story examines questions of revenge and justice from a theological, social and philosophical perspective. As recompense for their sinful violent behavior toward one another, God inflicts human beings with an earthquake. The earthquake is represented as the destruction of the "new world" that has betrayed the "old world", i.e. the church, the aristocracy, the "right" and "natural" order. But as the story unfolds, the tables begin to turn, and much like the earth itself, old beliefs, thought to be stable and fixed, shift and change.

**Orit Dudai** presented her research "Psychic Movement from Revenge to Redemption in Götz Spielmann's *Revanche* (2008)". In this presentation Orit, discussed a cinematic representation of revenge and the process of reparation in the film *Revanche*. The film's protagonist suffers trauma and humiliation, and yet she is able to overcome her vengeful desire. The film presents two ways for overcoming revenge: through the subject's relationship with nature, and through intersubjectivity. Both ways presuppose that the subject is always interwoven with some sort of "other", be it her natural environment or another subject. Dudai examined how these ways of overcoming revenge are interwoven, and eventually converge on an ethical solution in the form of taking responsibility and regaining a sense of empathy. *Revanche* thus provides a model for the psychic transformation from revenge to reconciliation and reparation.

**Gilad Shenhav** presented Derrida's "on Forgiveness" and "The Case for Reparations" (2014) by Ta-Nehisi Coates. The concept of forgiveness has proved to be indispensable for thinking about political reconciliation after the second World War, both within national and international frameworks. "Forgiveness", in this context, refers to a wide-range of strategies used to resolve tensions and conflicts stemming from historical crimes.

The two essays that were presented propose opposing approaches to forgiveness in the face of historical wrongdoings. Derrida argues that "forgiveness" should be regarded as a horizon for political thought rather than a goal which can be reached through calculable political actions. Only the unforgivable deed is an object of true forgiveness, according to him. Complete forgiveness can thus never be attained, it is incalculable, and always "to-come". Derrida does not object to political reconciliation as such, but he nonetheless rejects the possibility of reaching an equilibrium. Coates, in contrast, argues that historical reconciliation in the United States could be achieved only after the wrongdoings of the White Man have been documented, calculated, acknowledged, and at least partially compensated for through financial reparations. Coates attempts to retell the American story through a calculative narrative which exposes the systematic abuse of black communities by white men. Such a narrative substitutes the act of forgiveness for political calculation, and also serves as a strategy of remembrance.

**Tom Pesach** and **Manar Mahmud** presented the concept of **transitional justice**, by way of discussing two articles, one by Ian Lustick and another by Paul Van Zyl. Lustick's article examines the possibility that Israel would assume responsibility for creating the Palestinian refugees problem in light of West Germany's hesitant recognition of its historical responsibility for the Holocaust in the 1950s. Van Zyl defends the Truth and Reconciliation committee in South Africa in the face of the claim that it is economically unfeasible for a new regime to prosecute all those involved in the previous regime's crimes.

In the presentation, Mahmud emphasized that reconciliation cannot be limited to the issue of economic compensation, which was the central component in the German recognition of responsibility, according to Lustick. She raised the question of whether economic compensation can eventually lead to a deeper reconciliation, and if so, under what conditions. Pesach emphasized that the TRC's actions in South Africa were made possible by a change of regime, and that such a change is necessary for successful reconciliation.

**The members of the group this year were** Reaf Zriek, Avital Barak, Tom Pesach, Maram Masarwi, Manar Makhoul, Manar Mahmud, Avi Shilon, Asher Levi, Gal Hertz, Orit Dudai, Tammy Shel, Uri Landesberg, Gilad Shenhav.

Public event: *"Zionism in the Neo-Liberal Era: Capital, Space and Settlement"*, 22.4.2018

As part of the group's annual event series "From Settlers to Natives", we hosted the panel **Zionism in the Neo-Liberal Era: Capital, Space and Settlement**.

It took place in Tel Aviv University and was open to the public. The crowded room testified to the relevance of the subject to our academic community. The three perspectives presented in the panel corresponded to the core issues the group has been dealing with throughout the years.

Papers given in the panel:

*On Equality*

Professor Nira Yuval-Davis, University of East London

*The Logic behind the Fantasy of Shaping the Bi-National Space*

Professor Yosef Jabareen, Technion - Israel Institute of Technology

*Privatization, Nationalization and Creeping Apartheid*

Professor Oren Yiftachel, Ben Gurion University

Moderator: Professor Gadi Algazi, Tel Aviv University

## B.MHC Joint Programs

### 1. Humanities in Conflict Zones Project

Humanities in Conflict Zones is an initiative aimed at promoting Palestinian scholars, as well as sparking Palestinians' interest in the humanities at TAU. The previous year was dedicated to recruiting scholars in order to get the project off the ground. This year, we have moved to the second stage, initiating individual projects and integrating them in the different activities of the MHC. In addition, we have established close relationships with faculty members, including a cooperation with the Cohn institute that resulted in a study group on Islamic studies, and regular participation in the MHC research seminar. Another significant partner was the Jewish-Arabic Studies Program, with which we held two joint workshops this year on the Jewish-Arabic Question, and an Arabic-Hebrew Creative Writing Workshop. We have also worked with other faculty members on developing an academic support network for Palestinian students and on the *Insaan* digital platform. The highlight of our work this year, however, was the special event "Civilizations of Knowledge", in memoriam of Bert Cohn. This event brought together all of the project's partners and was a powerful manifestation of its essence, efficacy, and potential. This was apparent both at the international conference at TAU and during the event in Nazareth, where new frameworks for dealing with the complex relations of East and West have been explored. More particularly, we have examined the notion of "civilization" as a tool for dealing with diverse identities, and for creating new forms of knowledge as well as a more inclusive social and political community.

Our activities included:

- Study Group: Science and Religion in the Islamic World
- Joint Workshops and Activities with the Jewish-Arabic Studies Program
- Personal Projects of the Group's Fellows
- Teaching Science and Reach-Out programs
- The Bert Cohn Memoriam Conference

#### Below is a detailed report on our activities:

- *Study Group: Science and Religion in the Islamicate World*  
Together with the Cohn institute, we created a joint research group, named "Science and Faith within the Islamicate world". In the group's meetings, faculty and Ph.D students presented their projects on various issues pertaining to this subject, usually referring to an original Arabic text, followed by a group discussion and comments.

\* Head of the group: Miki Elazar. Members: Ahmad Igbaria (paper presentation),

Ido Yavets, Rivka Feldhay, Rodayna Ganeem (paper presentation), Yosseff Shwartz, Yousef Awabdeh, Yusri Khaizaran, Zahiye Kundos, Lina Jibali (paper presentation), Ryad Mansour (paper presentation).

- Joint Workshops and Activities with the Jewish-Arabic Studies Program*

Two joint workshops with the Jewish-Arabic Culture Program, a new BA program, were held this year. The Jewish-Arabic Culture Program aims to explore and reclaim the dynamic tradition of relations between the Jewish and Arabic cultures and languages, reaching from the middle ages to the present. The program is part of the Literature Department at TAU, and is headed by Galili Shahar and Almog Behar.

The first workshop, that took place in TAU in April, was the first Hebrew-Arabic creative writing workshop. 23 students participated (10 Jewish, 13 Palestinians), and they were guided by Dror Mishani, Zahiye Kundos, Rajaa Natour and Almog Behar. The Palestinian writer and editor Eyad Barguthy talked to the students about his linguistic challenges and dilemmas as a Palestinian fiction writer who aims for audiences across the Arab world. At the closing of the workshop, a special event featuring Palestinian rapper Tamer Nafar and our artist in residence Amer Hlehel took place. Hlehel presented his melodrama *Taha* for the first time at TAU.

The second workshop was organized by our fellow Manar Makhoul and Almog Behar as part of the annual gathering of the Jewish-Arab Program. The gathering, that took place in April, was aimed at raising and exploring key questions regarding the dynamics between religions, languages, literatures and identities in the wide context of Arabic Culture, taking in consideration the colonial and postcolonial situation.
- Personal Projects of the Group's Fellows*

**Zahiye Kundos** is a co-director of the group. Kundos has been developing the program and promoting it on and off campus. She successfully finished writing her PhD this year, titled "The Firm Unbreakable Bond': Al-Afghani and Abda on Modernistic Islam in the Critique of Modernity". The results of this research were presented in a conference at Cambridge University and at the Cohn Institute research seminar. She also presented a paper on the notion of civilization (*Madaniy'e*) at the Bert Cohn Memoriam Conference, held at TAU. In addition, she helped to organize and participated in two workshops in cooperation with the Jewish-Arab Studies Program (see programs above). She is currently working on developing these papers into publications and will dedicate the next year to publishing her book *In the Name of God: Toward an Islamic Civilization and Reforming the Islamic Soul*.

**Gal Hertz**, is also a co-director of the group, and shares with Kundos the responsibility for the initiative. He is also involved in the research project *Hebrew Literature as World Literature* held at the ZfL Berlin. His part in this project is titled "Enlightenment's Critical Prisoners: Modern Hebrew Literature and its Discontents."

#### **Conferences and Workshops Organized by Gal:**

International conference:

"Citing Violence, Inciting Critique: Karl Kraus, 1933", 22-24/11/2017, University of Antwerp.

"Spiritual Practices: Beyond the Modern Self", 24.4.17, workshop at the Van Leer Jerusalem Institute.

#### **Publications:**

- Submission: "From Epistemology of Suspicion to Racial Profiling: Hans Gross and the Discourse of Criminology around 1900", *Transfer: Interdisciplinary Journal of Mobility Studies*, Max Plank Institute.
- "Authenticity and Translation: Hans Rothe and the Shakespeare Controversy (1920-1935)", in: Frank Estelmann and Steffen Bruendel, (ed.), *Disasters of War and Violence: Perceptions and Representations, from 1914 to the Present*, München: Fink (forthcoming).
- "Pathologization of Everyday Life: Oskar Panizza's Syphilitic Literature", in: *Religion and Madness Around 1900: Between Pathology and Self-Empowerment*, edited by Lutz Greisiger, Sebastian Schuler, and Alexander Van Der Haven, *Diskurs Religion: Beiträge zur Religionsgeschichte und religiösen Zeitgeschichte*, Würzburg: Ergon, 2017.
- "Without Sentimentality: Karl Kraus Reads Rosa Luxemburg", in *The Creatures, the War and the Future of Poetry* [in Hebrew], Hakibutz Hameuchad, 2017.

#### **Maram Masarwi**

Masarwi's research deals with Palestinian commemoration in Israel, in the occupied territories and in the Gaza Strip. During the academic year 2017-18, She has conducted two qualitative studies on the Kafr Qasem massacre: one dealing with its implications for the education system, and another dealing with the connection between the political identity of local residents and their memory of the massacre. These studies rely on in-depth interviews and questionnaires distributed among 400 participants. She has also written a paper that summarizes the results of her research titled *The Kafr Qasem Massacre as Reflected in the Local School System: A Story of Three Generations*. In addition, she is currently co-authoring a second article on identity and massacre with the Israeli-American researcher Dr.

Tamir Sorek of the University of Florida. Masarwi's findings were also presented at the research seminar of the MHC (6.2.18). She also presented a paper about Palestinian Archives at the Lexicon Group for Political Thought (11.3.18), and has submitted to the Israeli Science Foundation a research proposal which deals with the issue of Palestinian and Israeli memory in the Balkans.

#### **Manar Mahmoud**

Mahmoud's research project is titled "Reconciliation and Transitional Justice in the Context of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict: Between Theory and Practice". During this academic year, she participated in a research workshop "Justice, Revenge and Forgiveness". In this workshop, she presented (with Tom Pesach), two articles that dealt with transitional justice. In addition, she presented her research project at the MHC research seminar. She is currently working on an article and a conference proposal.

#### **Manar Makhoul**

Makhoul has been working this year on implementing the Program for the Study of Arab-Jewish Cultures at Tel Aviv University, promoting it among prospective Palestinian students and high school teachers. He has also designed a course on Palestinian identity and literature, to be taught in the program in the coming academic year.

#### **Publications:**

- **August 2017-May 2018:** Revising the Arabic manuscript of a book on the evolution of Palestinian identity since 1948, through a critical reading of literature. The manuscript has been submitted to the Institute for Palestine Studies, and Makhoul is now awaiting the publisher's review and decision .
- **February 2018:** Submitting a proposal to publish an English edition of the aforementioned book with Edinburgh University Press. The proposal has been reviewed and approved, and Makhoul is now working on a full manuscript to be sent to the publisher's external reviewers.
- Throughout this past academic year, Makhoul has been writing a journal article, based on his current research project, titled "Athazagoraphobia: The Impact of the 1967 War on Palestinian Intellectuals".

#### **Conferences, panels and papers:**

- Presentation: "Opsimism: Between Emile Habiby and Franz Schubert". This presentation dealt with questions of identity and the relationship between art and society. It was given at the Keshet Eilon Music Center in Kibbutz Eilon in the Galilee, 29.12.2017.

- Co-organizing the conference "The Arab-Jewish Question: Language, Religion and Identities". The conference was held at Tel Aviv University, 30.4.2018.
- A panel at MESA's (The Middle East Studies Association) 52nd annual meeting:
- Co-organizing the panel "Fear of Oblivion: Intellectual Histories of Erasure in the Medieval and Contemporary Middle East", to be held in San Antonio, Texas (16.11.18). Makhoul will be presenting his current project ("Athazagoraphobia: The Impact of the 1967 War on Palestinian Intellectuals).

### **Yusri Khaizran**

#### **Publications:**

1. "Arab Society in Israel Following the 'Arab Spring'" *The Public Sphere* (Hebrew), (Forthcoming-July 2018). (First Author).
2. A forthcoming book with the Dayan center at Tel Aviv University, titled "Abandoned to its Fate: Arab Society in Israel in the Shadow of the 'Arab Spring'" (Forthcoming, 2018, First author). (see attached letter).
3. Review article about Dani Rubenstein's recent book "The Castle and Jerusalem" ("עלה זית וחרב" ), (Forthcoming, November 2018)
4. "Druzification of Arab Christians in Israel: Israel's Politics Toward Arab-Christians following the 'Arab Spring'" (submitted and currently under review).
5. Khaizran is also completing the first draft of a paper on the decline of rationalism and philosophy in medieval Islam, to be submitted by the end of summer, 2018.

### ***Teaching Science and Reach-Out Programs***

#### **Michael Elazar**

Elazar has organized, in collaboration with the Technion – Israel Institute of Technology, a four-day workshop for high-school physics teachers, on integrating historical and philosophical materials in teaching, in order to promote the causes and values of the Humanities in Conflict Zones project. This workshop, funded by the Technion, was held between the 29th of July and the 1st of August, 2018, and was open to physics teachers from the Arab sector. As of late June 2018, 38 teachers were registered to this workshop, including 13 Arab Israelis. The workshop was supervised by Elazar and Ma'ayan Schvartzter, a Ph.D student at the Technion's faculty of Education in Science and Technology.

Elazar was also involved in organizing the Conference in memoriam of Bert Cohn "Civilizations of Knowledge: Critical Reflections", as well as the event "The New Divan: Science, Islamic Culture and the Spirit of Music". In the context of the latter event, he has advised teacher Yousef Awabdy from Sisters of St. Joseph School in Nazareth and his students on the physical ideas of Ibn Sina (Avicenna).

**Publications:**

Jointly with Professor Rivka Feldhay, "Jesuit Conceptions of Impetus After Galileo: Honoré Fabri, Paolo Casati, and Francesco Eschinardi", in *Emergence and Expansion of Pre-Classical Mechanics*, eds. Rivka Feldhay, Jürgen Renn, Matthias Schemmel and Matteo Valleriani, Boston Studies in the Philosophy and History of Science, vol. 333, 2018.

**Yousef Awabdy**

Awabdy has been working on his PhD proposal, supervised by Dr. Ido Yavetz and Dr. Ahmad Igbaria. His research examines the relationship between the revival of Sunni Islam and the stagnation of natural philosophy in the Islamic world, between the 11th and 13th century. In addition, Awabdy was involved, together with Ahmad Igbaria, Miki Elazar and Yossi Schwartz, in forming three study groups for students from the Saint Joseph school in Nazareth. This was these students' first encounter with Islamic philosophy, dealing with issues such as the creation of the world, motion and the soul. Later on, participants shared their personal impressions of the study group in the Dan Cohen event in Nazareth.

***Artist in Residence: Amer Hlehel***

Hlehel has been conducting research for an art project about a man who recounts his war experiences, including the war crimes he has committed. The projected work draws on and is inspired by Shakespeare's "Richard III of England". Hlehel is aiming to bring out the relevance of Shakespeare's insights into human beings and war for a current war story, that seems oblivious to these insights.

Coming to realize that that the two stories cannot be brought together, Hlehel has decided to separate them into two projects. The first is an Arabic rendition of "Richard III of England", that offers a new way of understanding Shakespeare. It recounts the story from the point of view of a theatre playwright, rather than a poet or a scholar. The second project is the story of a contemporary man involved in war, that sheds light on the transformation from ordinary man to monster. Hlehel's participation in conference and events at MHC has inspired much of his work this year, and the discussions he held with the center's scholars has played an important role in shaping his current project.

***Civilizations of Knowledge: In Memoriam of Bert Cohn***

The first two days of the conference were held at Tel Aviv University (11-12.6.2018), as an international academic workshop, in cooperation with the Cohn institute. On the third day (13.6), a second part of the event was held at the Nazareth culture center, in cooperation with Polyphony Foundation and Saint Joseph High school. For a detailed description, see page 5, and in the conference programs attached.

---

## Books Review Project

The Book Review Project, directed by Mr. Uri Landesberg, is a series of public events held at the Tel Aviv University campus and in other locations in Tel Aviv. It consists in discussions of recently published books in the Humanities and the Social Sciences. The events are dedicated to innovative research books, primarily by authors from Israeli academia, and also to Hebrew translations of major works in Philosophy, History, Literature, Political Science, Cultural Studies and other disciplines.

The events, which usually attract a wide and diverse audience, are conducted as interdisciplinary panels of researches, including leading scholars and young researchers alike. By providing a stage for these encounters, MHC aims to establish a fertile and critical discussion on issues at the heart of contemporary academic debates, pertinent to the social and political questions of our time. Recent examples include discussions of the role of political myths in Zionism and Jewish culture and in conceptual-historical research, and an introduction to the complexities of cultivation of scientific knowledge within the Ottoman world and outside it. For details, see the event posters below.

## Detailed Event Programs



מרכז מינרבה למדעי הרוח  
Minerva Humanities Center  
مركز مينيرفا للاداب

*The Cohn Institute for the History  
and Philosophy of Science and Ideas*



תל אביב  
UNIVERSITY

# Civilizations of Knowledge: Critical Reflections

A Conference in Memoriam of Bert Cohn

**11 June**  
Room 496, Gilman Building, 4th floor

**14:00 – 15:30 Civilizations: The Universal and the Particular**  
Chair: Rivka Feldhay  
Ido Yavetz: Making the Obscure Visible  
Falko Schmider: Civilizations and Their Conceptual Discontent  
Raef Zreik: The Question of the Universal: Said and Fanon

**15:30 – 16:00 Short Break**

**16:00 – 17:30 Islamic Civilization as a Response to Modernity**  
Chair: Yusri Khaizran  
Wael Abu-'Uksa: Arabic Language of Modernity from Conceptual Perspective: The Formative Years 1820-1860  
Miri Shefer-Mossensohn: The History of the Concept of *'ilm* ("Knowledge"): Modernity, Changes, Continuities  
Zahiye Kundos: Islamic Civilization and its Hermeneutical Discontent - al-Afghāni and 'Abduh's Concept of *madaniyyah*

**17:30 – 18:00 Coffee Break**

**18:00 – 20:00 Keynote Lecture**  
Greetings: Leo Corry, Dean, Faculty of Humanities  
In Memoriam of Bert Cohn: Galen Guengerich  
Robert Morrison: Science, Islamic Societies, and the Italian Renaissance  
Chair: Israel Gershoni  
Commentator: Ahmad Igbaria

**12 June**  
Room 205, Trubowicz Building, Faculty of Law

**9:00 – 10:30 Jewish Civilization and its Exchanges with Islamicate and Christian Worlds**  
Chair: Maram Masarwi  
Menachem Fisch: Talmudic Judaism's Non-Socratic Dialogue of Civilizations  
Menachem Lorberbaum: The Language of Power: Maimonides' Onto-theological Model  
David Sorotzkin: The Transformation of Jewish Civilization in Christendom in the High and Late Middle Ages: Religion, Ethnicity and Social Engineering

**10:30 – 10:45 Coffee Break**

**10:45 – 12:15 Christian Civilization**  
Chair: Shaul Katzir  
Yossef Schwartz: Different Models of Encounter with Foreign Knowledge in Christian Culture  
Paz Chen Morris: Western Ocularcentrism reconsidered  
Barbara U. Meyer: The Problems of Sharing Knowledge and Memory in Christian Civilization

**12:15 – 13:45 Lunch Break**

**13:45 – 14:15 Theatrical Intervention**  
**Amer Hlehel: "Winter of Our Discontent"**

**14:15 – 15:45 : Round Table**  
**The Concept of Civilization: Critical Reflections**  
José Brunner (chair and discussant), Haim Hazan, Eva Jablonka, Gadi Algazi

**11–12 June 2018, Tel Aviv**



מרכז מינרבה למדעי הרוח  
Minerva Humanities Center  
مركز مينرفا للاداب



אוניברסיטת תל אביב  
TEL AVIV UNIVERSITY

## הכנס הלקסיקלי ה-15 למחשבה פוליטית ביקורתית

14:30 - 13:00

יו"ר: חן משגב, אוניברסיטת בן-גוריון  
בנגב ואוניברסיטת תל-אביב

**תקווה חתרנית** טל ניצן,  
האוניברסיטה העברית בירושלים

**הזנה** טליה הופמן, אמנית

**אהבה** יואב רונאל,  
אוניברסיטת בן-גוריון בנגב

15:30 - 14:30 הפסקת צהריים

17:00 - 15:30

יו"ר: איתי שניר, אוניברסיטת תל-אביב

**זיכרון** מראם מסארווה,  
מכללת אלקאסמי  
ואוניברסיטת תל-אביב

**אנדרטה** אודי אדלמן,  
המרכז לאמנות דיגיטלית, חולון

**ילדות** אפרת אבן-צור,  
אוניברסיטת תל-אביב

18:30 - 17:15

יו"ר: רותי גינזבורג,  
בצלאל ומכללת בית-ברל

**פוליטיסייד** מירב אמיר,  
אוניברסיטת קווינס, בלפסט

**שיבה** נטע וינר, אמן

9:30 - 9:00 התכנסות

11:00 - 09:30

יו"ר: אריאל הנדל,  
אוניברסיטת תל-אביב

**שוליים** לבנת קונפוני-דקלב,  
אוניברסיטת תל-אביב

**כיפת ברזל** ארי בראל,  
אוניברסיטת בן-גוריון בנגב

**שיום** עאמר דהאמשה,  
המכללה האקדמית הערבית לחינוך  
בחיפה והמכון ע"ש הארי סי טרומן,  
האוניברסיטה העברית בירושלים

12:45 - 11:15

יו"ר: מיכל גבעוני,  
אוניברסיטת בן-גוריון בנגב

**מדד המגדר** חנה הרצוג,  
אוניברסיטת תל-אביב  
ו"שוות" לקידום נשים בזירה הציבורית

**פרדגויה פמיניסטית** תמר הגר,  
מכללת תל-חי

**דוד ראשון** אפרת גזית בן-שושן והילה  
דיין, אוניברסיטת תל-אביב  
ואמסטרדם יוניברסיטי קולג'

**יום ב' 14.5.2018**

אוניברסיטת תל-אביב, בניין גילמן, חדר 458 | כניסה חופשית

אתר הבית של מרכז מינרבה: [mhc.tau.ac.il](http://mhc.tau.ac.il)

אתר מפתח: כתב-עת לקסיקלי למחשבה פוליטית: [mafteakh.tau.ac.il](http://mafteakh.tau.ac.il)



מרכז מינרבה למדעי הרוח  
Minerva Humanities Center  
مركز مينرفا للآداب



מכון ון ליר בירושלים  
THE VAN LEEUWEN JERUSALEM INSTITUTE  
معهد فان لير في القدس



אוניברסיטת תל אביב  
TEL AVIV UNIVERSITY

קבוצת הלקסיקון למחשבה פוליטית ביקורתית  
במרכז מינרבה למדעי הרוח, אוניברסיטת תל-אביב ומכון ון ליר בירושלים

## סדנה לקסיקלית מושגים פוליטיים של מחאה: ידע, פעולה, טכנולוגיות

14:00 – 15:00 הפסקת צהריים

15:00 – 16:45

יו"ד: חגי בועז, מכון ון ליר בירושלים

### אקטיביזם כמותני

ענת לייבלר, אוניברסיטת בר-אילן

### מעקב השתתפותי

דונן אידלמן, הטכניון - מכון טכנולוגי לישראל

### פריעה פוליטית

הנרייט דהאן-כלב, אוניברסיטת בן-גוריון בנגב

17:15 – 19:00

יו"ד: רותי גינזבורג, אוניברסיטת תל-אביב

### ביקורת בונה

שלי כהן, אוניברסיטת תל-אביב

### מדע אזרחי

חגית קיסר, אוניברסיטת תל-אביב

### מיפוי שכנגד

אורנה ועדיה, אוניברסיטת בן-גוריון בנגב

9:30 – 9:45 התכנסות

9:45 – 10:00 ברכות

חגי בועז מכון ון ליר בירושלים

אריאל הנדל אוניברסיטת תל-אביב

10:00 – 11:45

יו"ד: עפרי אילני, האקדמיה ע"ש פולונסקי

במכון ון ליר בירושלים

### מסמך

עמרי גרינברג, אוניברסיטת טורונטו

### תקשורת אלטרנטיבית

האמה אבו-קשק, אוניברסיטת תל-אביב

### מחאה טקסית

עודד היילברונר, שנקר - בי"ס גבוה להנדסה

ולעיצוב

12:15 – 14:00

יו"ד: חן משגב, אוניברסיטת תל-אביב

ואוניברסיטת בן-גוריון בנגב

### פמיניזם מזרחי

שולה קשת, תנועת אחותי - למען נשים בישראל

### התנגדות בתנועה

אביטל ברק, אוניברסיטת תל-אביב

### שולחן

איתי שניר, אוניברסיטת תל-אביב

יום רביעי, 2.5.2018

חדר 207, בניין האקדמיה ע"ש פולונסקי,  
מכון ון ליר בירושלים, זיבוטינסקי 43, ירושלים

אתר הבית של מרכז מינרבה: [mhc.tau.ac.il](http://mhc.tau.ac.il)

אתר מפתח: כתב-עת לקסיקלי למחשבה פוליטית: [mafteakh.tau.ac.il](http://mafteakh.tau.ac.il)



התכנית ללימודי תרבות  
ערבית-יהודית  
البرنامج لدراسة الثقافة  
العربية-اليهودية



אוניברסיטה תל-אביב

קול קורא

# סדנה בכתיבה יוצרת בין ערבית לעברית

איך כותבים בין העברית לערבית? בשתיקה? בשיטפון?  
מערבבים בין השפות, עוברים ביניהן, או בוחרים באחת מהן לבדה?  
מתרגמים, או מותירים מילים לא-מובנות?

**23.04.2018**

## לוח זמנים של הסדנה

11:00	התכנסות לסיום היסטורי משותף בקמפוס האוניברסיטה בהנחיית אחמד אגבאריה
12:00	גילמן, חדר 180: סדנת תרגום ושירה בהנחיית רג'אא נאטור ואלמוג בהר
14:00	הפסקה צהריים
14:45	גילמן, חדר 180: סדנת פרזזה בהנחיית זהירה קנדוס ודור משעני
17:00	גילמן, חדר 180: שיחה עם איאד ברגותי
18:30	סיכום

בסדנה נרצה לחשוב על הכלים שיאפשרו לנו להתחיל להתבונן על "המרחב" שבו נפגשות שתי השפות, הערבית והעברית (המתקיימות כל אחת גם לצד שפות נוספות) עם מבט עכשווי ומבט לעבר היסטוריה ארוכת ימים.

מה הוא אותו "מרחב" שאנחנו מנסות לחשוב אותו, ליצור אותו, להזמין אתכן לבקר בתוכו ולמרוד בו? האם יש לו שם או הגדרה? הוא יש לו מקום או שהוא מתקיים כל הזמן בין לבין או אף בדמיון? האם הוא עבר ברוך, הווה נוכח או רק עתיד אוטופי?

בסדנה יכולים להשתתף סטודנטים יהודים אחת מן השפות לפחות, עברית או ערבית. הסדנה פתוחה לסטודנטים ולבוגרים של אוניברסיטת תל-אביב. יש להירשם לסדנה עד לתאריך ה-18.4.2018 במייל לכתובת הבאה:

[workshop@insan-network.org](mailto:workshop@insan-network.org)



@JewishArabCultureStudies



@insan.network



**insān**  
Arabic Humanities  
and Social Sciences  
Network

מרכז מינרבה  
למדעי הרוח  
Minerva Humanities Center

התכנית ללימודי תרבות  
ערבית-יהודית  
البرنامج لدراسة الثقافة  
العربية-اليهودية



אוניברסיטה תל-אביב

התכנית ללימודי תרבות ערבית-יהודית מזמינה אתכם לכנס בנושא

# השאלה הערבית-יהודית שפה, דת וזהויות

ביום שני, ה-30.4.2018, אולם 206, בניין משפטים, אוניברסיטת תל-אביב

Stay connected

[@JewishArabCultureStudies](#)

[@insan.network](#)

במסגרת הכינוס השנתי של התכנית ללימודי תרבות ערבית-יהודית בחוג לספרות, לכבוד מורנו פרופ' ששון סומך, חוקר בכיר ומתרגם ספרות ושירה ערבית, במלאות לו שמונים וחמש שנה, אנחנו מבקשים לבחון מחדש את השאלה הערבית-יהודית מצדדיה השונים, כשאלה על יחסים וקשרים בין דתות, תרבויות, לשונות, ספרויות וזהויות בתוך המסגרת הרחבה של התרבות הערבית, וזאת מתוך מבט על ההווה וגם על העבר, אל העידן הקולוניאלי והמצב הפוסט-קולוניאלי.

09:30-10:00 התכנסות וקפה

## בין דין לדת יו"ר: פרופ' גלילי שחר

10:00-11:30 ד"ר לינא סלאימה: Comparing Jewish and Islamic Law  
ד"ר אפנאן מסארה סרור: נשות המסגד: למידה חתרנית של ידע דתי  
ד"ר ג'וני מנסור: הנוצרים בארץ הקודש בין ענייניהם הלוקאליים לעניינים אזוריים

## מה שלא עובר בתרגום יו"ר: ד"ר מנאר מח'ול

11:45-13:15 ד"ר נדים כרכבי: דת, אתניות ושפה ב"מוזיקה ערבית" בישראל  
ד"ר ורד מדר: תרבות בעל-פה ומרחב יהודי בערבית  
ד"ר הודא אבו מוך: תרגום מערבית לעברית ככלי לייצוג האחר

## זהויות ומסכות יו"ר: ד"ר בני מריאלי

14:15-15:45 גב' מהא נקיב: האינטרס הציוני: בין רעיון כור ההיתוך לתחיית תרבויות עתיקות  
ד"ר הדס שבת-נדיר: לפרק את מושג המסורת: על "ערים של מטה" לשמעון אדף  
ד"ר אלמוג בהר: מה מזרחי ביהודי-הערבי? ומה יהודי-ערבי במזרחי? - בעקבות פרופ' ששון סומך

## מישהו כאן מדבר ערבית-יהודית? יו"ר: ד"ר אלמוג בהר

16:00-17:30 גב' זיהיה קונדוס: השפה היפואית בין הבקע הקולוניאלי לאפשרות פוסט קולוניאלית  
גב' עדי קיסר: נְאֻת כָּל מָה שְׁלֵאל הַבְּנֵיתִי / אֵת כָּל מָה שְׁלֵאל דְּבַרְתִּי / אֲנִי בֹתְבֵת  
גב' ענבל ג'משיד: לא דיברנו מספיק על המזרח



 polyphony  
foundation

 Ecole des Soeurs de St. Joseph  
مدرسة راهبات مار يوسف

 مركز مينارفا للآداب  
Minerva Humanities Center

 جامعة تل أبيب

**13.06.2018**  
Berkowitz Culture Center  
Ma'ale Itzhak Blv. 4  
**Nazareth Illit**

**The New Divan**  
Science, Islamic Culture  
and the Spirit of Music  
In loving memory of Bert Cohn



**עלמא**  
Minerva Humanities Center  
Tel Aviv University

מרכז מינרבה  
למדעי הרוח

אוניברסיטת  
תל אביב  
TEL AVIV  
UNIVERSITY

# WRESTLING JERUSALEM

להיאבק בירושלים

הקרנה מיוחדת של הסרט ודיון  
**19:00, 10.6.18**  
בית עלמא

**תכנית הערב**  
הקרנת הסרט (אנגלית בתרגום לעברית)  
מירב ג'ונס – על המאבק בין ציונות לליברליזם בקרב הציבור  
היהודי-אמריקאי  
תומר פרסיקו – כלים שבורים? בין הרוחני לפוליטי  
מגיב: אהרון דוידמן, יוצר הסרט



ערב עיון ושיח בנושא חקר הפעילות המדעית בעולם העות'מאני  
סביב הספר

## Science among the Ottomans: The Cultural Creation and Exchange of Knowledge

מירי שפר-מוסנזון

Science *among the* Ottomans

The Cultural  
Creation &  
Exchange of  
Knowledge  
—  
Miri Shefer-  
Mossensohn



**דברי ברכה:**

אייל זיסר, סגן הרקטור  
אוניברסיטת תל אביב

יו"ר: ישראל גרשוני  
אוניברסיטת תל אביב

**דוברים-מתדיינים:**

אסף גולדשמידט  
אוניברסיטת תל אביב

ליאת קוזמא  
האוניברסיטה העברית  
בירושלים

אורי קופרשמידט  
אוניברסיטת חיפה

**מגיבה, מחברת הספר:**  
מירי שפר-מוסנזון,  
אוניברסיטת תל אביב

יום ג', כ"ה ניסן, תשע"ח | 10 באפריל 2018

17:30-20:00 | 17:30-18:15 התכנסות וכיבוד קל

אוניברסיטת ת"א, בניין גילמן, חדר 449

הכניסה חופשית - דיון פתוח בהשתתפות הקהל