

ISRAEL

STUDIES IN ZIONISM AND THE STATE OF ISRAEL
HISTORY, SOCIETY, CULTURE

The Chaim Weizmann Institute for the Study of Zionism and Israel was set up in 1962 at Tel Aviv University through the initiative and with the assistance of the Executive of the World Zionist Organization, with the aim of furthering the research and the teaching of the history of the Zionist idea, the Zionist movement and the Land of Israel in modern times.

ISRAEL

STUDIES IN ZIONISM AND THE STATE OF ISRAEL
HISTORY, SOCIETY, CULTURE

No. 31-32, 2024



TEL AVIV UNIVERSITY

THE CHAIM ROSENBERG SCHOOL OF JEWISH STUDIES
THE CHAIM WEIZMANN INSTITUTE FOR THE STUDY OF ZIONISM AND ISRAEL

Editor: Nimrod Lin

Editorial Board: Arie M. Dubnov, Nissim Leon, Gil-li Vardi,
Liora R. Halperin, Avi Shilon, Abigail Jacobson, Mustafa Abbasi

Front cover:
Be'eri Valley, Rotem Berkowitz

Back cover:
Detail from the cover

© 2024

All Rights Reserved
Tel Aviv University
The Chaim Weizmann Institute for the Study of Zionism and Israel

Graphic Editing: Michal Semo and Yael Bieber, TAU Graphic Design Studio
Printed in Israel by Sdar Zalam

CONTENTS

ARTICLES

Millionaires with Swimming Pools? Menachem Begin and the Kibbutz Movement, 1948–1981 Amir Goldstein.....	7
A Feminine Reading of <i>Megillat Eikha</i> (the Book of Lamentations) at a Reform Jewish Congregation in Jaffa Elazar Ben-Lulu.....	39
The Boycott and Censorship of “German” Films in Israel, 1948–1967 Giora Goodman.....	59
Forerunner of the Camp: Nachman Syrkin and Israeli Constructive Socialism Eilon Shamir and Elon Pauker.....	93
“I Did It because It Was My Duty”: Personal and Ideological Commitment in the Experience of Women Volunteers from Jewish Palestine in the Spanish Civil War Raanan Rein and Dror Sharon.....	121
The Upheaval in the Kibbutz Movement: From Welfare Society to Market Society Doron Nadiv.....	149
Establishing the “Civilian Settlement” of Kefar Etzion in the Summer of 1967: The Governmental Decision and Its Making Nadav Frenkel.....	173
The Debate over the Recruitment of Yeshiva Students in Eretz Israel during World War II Amihai Radzyner.....	197
From Right Wing to Left Wing: The Political Path of Jacob Cahan Ze’ev Miron.....	223
Disputes among Zionism, Israeliness, and Dispersion: Reflection of the State of Israel’s Attitude toward Diaspora Communities in Political-Party Platforms Yitzhak Mualem.....	247
The Jewish Community Council of Jerusalem and “Hebrew Labor”: Between Local Identity and National-Institutional Affinity Tal Chenya.....	277

“Stepdaughters for the Patrons of the City”: Tel Aviv’s Marginal Neighborhoods as a Key to a Renewed Understanding of the National and Urban Space During the Mandate Period	
Elia Etkin	303
“Although They Are Religious in the Rest of the Mitzvot”: Observant Orientalism in the Bnei Akiva Youth Movement	
David Borabeck	323
The Division of Political Powers during the Mandate Period according to Rabbi Kook	
Aryeh Bernstein	347
Improving Their Housing and Minding the Frontier: “Tenements for Evacuees” in pre-1967 Israeli Jerusalem as a Unique Case of Security Settlement	
Eldad Brin	371
Shlomo Lahat’s Election in 1973 as Mayor of Tel Aviv: A Harbinger of the National Upheaval of 1977?	
Arnon Golan	391
The Schism in Ha-Kibbutz Ha-Meuhad Movement: Between Tatters of Torn Memory	
Avital Ginat	411
Between the Personal and the Political: Dr. Israel Eldad and the Leadership of Menachem Begin and David Ben-Gurion	
Oded Peled	435
The Mixed Armistice Commissions and the Demarcation of Israel’s Ceasefire Lines after the War of Independence	
Yoram Fried	463
The Path to a Military Academy: The Establishment of the Military Academy at Reali High School in Haifa as a Unique Military-Civilian Model	
Elad Neemani	485
Was it Possible to Prevent the 1973 War?	
Yoav Gelber	503
List of Contributors	537
English Summaries	VII

Summaries

Amir Goldstein

Millionaires with Swimming Pools? Menachem Begin and the Kibbutz Movement, 1948–1981

The Zionist-Israeli Right and the Kibbutz Movement have shared a longstanding and powerful historical rivalry, but their interrelations have been more complex than presented in historiography and recollected in the public consciousness. They were affected by the political power of the two groups, their position within the Israeli socioeconomic fabric, and the issues at the core of the public agenda in Israel. In this article, I examine the interfaces among Menachem Begin, the parties under his leadership, and the kibbutzim, from the establishment of the state until the end of 1981. Such an exploration reveals different stages, discrete trends, and more complex political relations than the rather superficial image engraved in the collective memory. The first stage (1948–966) and the last (1972–1983) are characterized by confrontation and poignant polemics that have not yet been systematically presented and analyzed. In between was a liminal era that has received almost no attention or theorization in historiography—the late 1960s and early 1970s, an interval characterized by rapprochement and reconciliation. The deterioration in relations between the Likud and the Kibbutz Movement came about in the wake of the political “upheaval.” In the article, I examine both sides’ contributions to the dynamics of escalation, the various economic, social, and political contexts within which the escalation manifested itself, and its place in the political history of Israel at large.

Elazar Ben-Lulu

A Feminine Reading of *Megillat Eikha* (the Book of Lamentations) at a Reform Jewish Congregation in Jaffa

On the evening of Tisha B’Av, it is customary to read the Book of Lamentations (*Megillat Eikha*) a collection of five laments that were compiled after the destruction of Jerusalem and canonized in Scripture. Each lament serves as a theological document that plays a crucial role in the spiritual restoration of the nation amidst a profound sense of hopelessness and longing for redemption. This ethnographic study differs from traditional research, which typically focuses on the scroll as a textual reflection of exile and theological themes on Tisha B’Av. Instead, I view the scroll as a ritual platform for unveiling gender and political concepts that feature active female leadership and participation. Through ethnographic analysis at the Daniel Congregation in Jaffa, an Israeli Reform community, I explore how congregants interpret the content of the lamentations, particularly their gender aspects, and

reveal diverse and vivid meanings. The performativity of the reading, encompassing vocal and physical elements, along with efforts to deconstruct and integrate other texts, establishes a profound connection between the written and the performed word. The participation of women challenges both tradition ritual practices and patriarchal social norms. The ethnographic description highlights the congregants' use of the act of mourning to examine contemporary realities through a gendered lens. The participants seek explanations for their life experiences within the verses of the scroll, engaging in an open dialogue with the scriptures. Consequently, this traditional ritual, laden with national and theological significance, has evolved into a potent political tool utilized to interpret critical moments of personal pain and loss.

Giora Goodman

The Boycott and Censorship of “German” Films in Israel, 1948–1967

In this article I examine the boycott and censorship of “German” films—a broad definition that included German-speaking films made in other countries—in Israel’s first two decades. By making extensive use of archive documents, I shed light on the government policy of boycotting German- and Austrian-made films in Israeli cinemas and the public debate that it engendered. In the late 1950s, diplomatic and commercial pressures forced the Israeli government to establish a new policy that allowed dozens of Austrian-made films, and soon also West-German-made films ostensibly “co-produced” with another country, to be distributed. German-speaking films were highly popular but their screening drew protests from Holocaust survivors’ groups, sparking an animated public debate. The Israeli film censorship board, itself split on the issue, sought at least to enforce a policy of personal boycott of filmmakers who had a Nazi past and to censor films in German or any other language that portrayed “good Germans” during the years of the Third Reich. This censorship policy was intended to prevent any offence to public feelings, mostly of Holocaust survivors, but it also provoked sharp criticism because it withheld from Israeli cinema audiences films that sent an anti-Nazi message or revealed a touch of the horrors of the Holocaust. Thus, my discussion of the boycott and censorship of German films illuminates, from a less familiar angle, the poignant debate in Israeli society in its first two decades regarding Holocaust memory and the evolving relationship with postwar Germany.

Eilon Shamir and Elon Pauker

Forerunner of the Camp: Nachman Syrkin and Israeli Constructive Socialism

Analyzed in this article analyzes, in a way not undertaken in research so far, the influence of Nachman Syrkin on the leadership of *Ahdut Ha’Avoda*, which shaped extensive aspects of the Israeli reality before and after the establishment of the state.

The beginning of this influence stems from Syrkin's early essay, "The Jewish Problem and the Socialist Jewish State" (1898), in which he formulated the basic lines of constructive socialism. The relationship developed mainly after 1908 until his death in 1924. The discussion follows Ben-Gurion's acquaintance with Syrkin's views during his stay in America (1915–1918) and Syrkin's influence on Berl Katznelson, which is evident in Katznelson's important speech "Facing the Days Ahead." Katznelson and Syrkin met at the Poale Zion conference in Stockholm in 1919, in which Katznelson referred to Syrkin as his "Rabbi," according to his own testimony. It was at the conference that Syrkin coined the term "constructive socialism" in a Zionist context. Later, in 1920, Syrkin led a Poale Zion delegation to Israel that turned into a seminar of sorts, several months long. During the delegation's work, the baton was passed from visionary, Syrkin, to the Ahdut Ha'Avoda young leadership as represented by Ben-Gurion, Tabenkin, and others. In the spirit of Syrkin's vision, Ahdut Ha'Avoda initiated a policy of constructive socialism that shaped major aspects of the State of Israel.

Raanan Rein and Dror Sharon

"I Did It because It Was My Duty": Personal and Ideological Commitment
in the Experience of Women Volunteers from Jewish Palestine in the
Spanish Civil War

During the Spanish Civil War (1936–1939), 150–200 volunteers left Mandatory Palestine to support the Republican cause. Most of them were communist, Jewish, and male; about fourteen of them, however, were women. In this article, we trace the history of four Jewish women who left Palestine to aid the Spanish Republic—three of whom eventually reaching the Iberian Peninsula and one remaining in Paris. Through a close reading of letters, oral and written testimonials, and press sources, we discuss the motives that led these women to volunteer in Spain, the role of social and familial networks in shaping their decision, and the personal costs they paid for their unusual choice. Our analysis of the personal stories of Dora Levin, Adela Botwinska, Ruth Maliniak, and Yael Gerson sheds new light on the little-explored subject of foreign female volunteers in the Spanish Civil War, as well as on the history of volunteers from the Yishuv in Palestine.

Doron Nadiv

The Upheaval in the Kibbutz Movement: From Welfare Society to
Market Society

The financial crisis that struck the kibbutz movement in the mid-1980s triggered a crisis the likes of which the movement had never known. It arose mainly from the debt that ballooned following the government's Economic Stabilization Plan (July

1985). The debt led many kibbutz members to lose their trust in their movement's institutions and ideology and accelerated the processes of change that, deeply influenced by the neoliberal turn that Israel had taken from the late 1970 on, led to the creation of the "new kibbutz" model. In the article, I examine the process in which, between 1985 and 2005, the supporters of the "new kibbutz" ceased to be an opposition group and assumed the leadership of the kibbutz movement, and investigate the transformation of the orientation of the kibbutz movement from a welfare society to a market society.

Nadav Frenkel

Establishing the "Civilian Settlement" of Kefar Etzion in the Summer of 1967: The Governmental Decision and Its Making

Kefar Etzion, a kibbutz that the Arab Legion destroyed in the War of Independence, was resettled in late September 1967 and became the first Israeli settlement to be established in the West Bank after the Six-Day War. Using the minutes of relevant meetings that were recently made public, I analyze discussions of the Israeli Government and the Ministerial Committee for Security Affairs that took place in the summer of 1967 and ultimately led to the establishment of this "civilian Nahal settlement," being a corps of the IDF. Beyond the factual outline of the discussions, presented in full for the first time, I make two main claims: (i) the decision to resettle Kefar Etzion was made possible by the creation of a coalition of several centers of power in the Israeli Government and the Ministerial Committee for Defense Affairs, which ultimately influenced, after much deliberation, the decision of Prime Minister Levi Eshkol to go ahead; and (ii) the concept of a "civilian Nahal settlement," via which Kefar Etzion was reestablished, had not existed until that time.

Amihai Radzyner

The Debate over the Recruitment of Yeshiva Students in Eretz Israel during World War II

In the Israeli academic, legal, and public discourse, the issue of exempting yeshiva students from army service is often presented as having its roots in 1948. In this article, however, I highlight a discussion that actually began in 1939 and continued during the years of World War II. The deliberations, questions, and arguments raised at that time resurfaced in subsequent decades. The article focuses on the efforts of several individuals, Chief Rabbi Herzog leading the way, to exempt yeshiva students in Eretz Israel from enlisting in the British Army and from carrying out other obligations that the Yishuv institutions imposed on men of relevant ages. Surprisingly, the Chief Rabbinate of Palestine had already reached an agreement in 1939 to involve itself in the issue of recruiting yeshiva students. The various

reasons for demanding an exemption from enlistment are examined in the article, the primary argument being that the yeshivas of Eretz Israel served as surrogates for the world of Torah that was being destroyed in Europe. This contention emerged as early as 1939. In another significant argument added later, it was suggested that yeshiva students should be likened to students in theological training institutions in the United States and England, who were exempted from military service. I also touch the limited public debate that occurred during the war years regarding the exemption granted to yeshiva students and the moral dilemma that it posed.

Ze'ev Miron

From Right Wing to Left Wing: The Political Path of Jacob Cahan

In this article, I scrutinize the ideological and political trajectory of Jacob Cahan over time. From his position as president of the Revisionist Movement in Poland, Cahan underwent a significant transformation in his approach toward the Zionist Labor Movement and its constructive endeavors subsequent to his immigration to Eretz Israel. Immigration altered Cahan's perception of the country's political and social landscape, inducing him to diverge from his role as the Revisionist president within Polish Jewry. In this study I explore the motivations underlying Cahan's decision to acknowledge the contributions of the Labor Movement to the Zionist cause and to disavow the Revisionist Movement. Aligning himself with the Histadrut, Cahan published his latest poetic works in the Histadrut newspaper *Davar* and actively engaged in intellectual pursuits organized by Mapai. Despite suspicions surrounding his newfound allegiance to the Labor ideology, both Mapai and the Histadrut leadership viewed Cahan favorably; conversely, Cahan rebuffed attempts by the Revisionist Movement to re-establish connections. His political transition not only underscores the allure of a dominant political entity but also reflects the ideological shifts experienced by immigrants.

Yitzhak Mualem

Disputes among Zionism, Israeliness, and Dispersion: Reflection of the State of Israel's Attitude toward Diaspora Communities in Political-Party Platforms

In this study, I analyze the positions and policies of political parties in Israel in relation to Jewish communities in the Diaspora. In so doing, I present a new tool for research in this field, political-party platforms, that paints a dynamic picture of Israeli society's attitude towards the Diaspora from the establishment of statehood to this day. The research question is: To what extent, and in what way, was the Diaspora component reflected in the platforms of parties in Israel from the elections to the Constituent Assembly, in 1949, to the elections in 2019? The analysis of the platforms over the years affords a long-term view of the dynamism of their

attitude toward the Diaspora in its thematic dimension and in terms of importance. Thematically, the parties' positions are assessed in accordance with three categories: Jewish, Zionist, and Israeli. The most striking finding is that the Zionist category was the most common in most of the platform literature. Within this context, it is of particular interest to find this category also common in the platforms of ultra-Orthodox parties. Another finding is the attitude of the parties of European birth toward the Diaspora question. The parties that originated in Europe made sure to express, in their platforms, the Jewish dimension and the demand to strengthen the position of the Zionist Movement and the welfare of Diaspora Jewry.

Tal Chenya

The Jewish Community Council of Jerusalem and "Hebrew Labor": Between Local Identity and National-Institutional Affinity

In research into the Yishuv, the concept of "Hebrew labor" (*avoda ivrit*) is identified as one of the most prominent in Zionism. In this article, it is discussed from Zionist-national, colonial, and class (Jewish and Arab) points of view. I examine the *avoda ivrit* issue of from a local perspective, that of 1920s Jerusalem, as a specific time and place that reflect a complex dynamic in the context of post-British-conquest Jerusalem, when the local Jewish population was supported by the Jewish Community Council of Jerusalem (hereinafter: the Council), a communal arm of the National Institutions. This support was manifested in basic material supplies, thus allowing the Council to be perceived by the local Jewish population as a central relief and political entity and, in turn, making the Council the object of public affection. In addition, at a time when Jewish–Arab social connections (including employment) were the norm in Jerusalem, the Council demanded that local Jewish employers of non-Jews adopt the Zionist national principle of *avoda ivrit*. Presenting various examples in the article, I point out instances of cooperation with or apologetic response to the Council's leadership by locals who employed Arabs. In my main argument, I claim that this response stemmed not from an ideological identification with the concept of *avoda ivrit* but from the public's positive regard for the Council in view of the wartime conditions. This affinity, however, did not override local identity as the employment of Arab workers continued even among public figures who were members of the Council.

Elia Etkin

“Stepdaughters for the Patrons of the City”: Tel Aviv’s Marginal Neighborhoods as a Key to a Renewed Understanding of the National and Urban Space During the Mandate Period

In this article, I present “neighborhood citizenship” as a crucial element in the consolidation of social identity within the Jewish community during the British Mandate for Palestine. I examine the marginal neighborhoods of Tel Aviv, the city that emerged as the center of the Yishuv (the country’s organized Jewish community) during the Mandate period, to demonstrate how these neighborhoods functioned as organic social units of identification that motivated civic action. Using the term “neighborhood citizenship,” I argue that local civic activity reflected residents’ identification with their neighborhood space and explains their involvement in the public arena and the struggles they undertook. Furthermore, I show that examining “neighborhood citizenship” through the activities of residents in Tel Aviv’s marginal neighborhoods, particularly the neighborhood committees on the southern and eastern fringes of the city during the 1920s and 1940s, reveals tensions between national identification and national or municipal interests and local identification and civic action that I define as “insurgent citizenship.”

David Borabeck

“Although They Are Religious in the Rest of the Mitzvot”: Observant Orientalism in the Bnei Akiva Youth Movement

In this article, I examine the activities of the Religious-Zionist Bnei Akiva youth movement among Mizrahi immigrants after the establishment of the State of Israel in order to probe Religious-Zionist ambivalence towards the Mizrahim and their traditions. On the one hand, Mizrahim were included in the Religious-Zionist collective on the basis of their definition as “religious.” On the other hand, because their religiosity was frowned upon as neither rational nor consistent, Mizrahim faced discrimination as “non-religious” according to modern Ashkenazi Orthodox standards. By taking a closer look at this unique “observant Orientalist” phenomenon, I deconstruct the term “religion” and examine it as a product of European secularism. In doing so, I challenge the accepted perception of Religious-Zionism and shed new light on the movement’s ideology and theology. An essential term in this examination is the “religious melting pot.” In accordance with this ideology and practice, Mizrahim were stripped of their traditions and cultures and underwent massive acculturation in order to become part of the Religious-Zionist collective. This inclusion, however, was not complete, as Mizrahim were suspected of not being ideologues by nature and thus incapable of joining religious kibbutzim. The Ashkenazi disdain for traditional Mizrahi texts, cult of saints, and rituals also characterizes this phenomenon. The textbooks, rituals, and parades that the Bnei

Akiva movement arranged for Mizrahim included texts that subordinate religion to modern ideals such as Zionist pioneerism, nationalism, and socialism. Additionally, using traditional texts, these activities demonstrate the negation of exile, which was based on the negation of the Mizrahim themselves.

Aryeh Bernstein

The Division of Political Powers during the Mandate Period according to
Rabbi Kook

In this article, I deal with Rabbi Abraham Yitzchak Kook's political views during the British Mandate years and question the validity of the opposing stances that research has accredited to this personality: political activism on the one hand and universalistic, anti-use-of-force moderation on the other. The attribution of both dichotomous views to Rabbi Kook traces to lack of research into his political opinions. This article offers a systematic analysis of Rabbi Kook's views and shows that, countering the common belief, Rabbi Kook did hold concrete political ideas and that, in contrast to the common perception of him as disconnected from reality, he was actually quite realistic and pragmatic. Rabbi Kook believed that the British had a very important role to play in the Jews' Redemption. Rabbi Kook's views reveal a recurrent theme regarding the division of political powers: The British are the chief political authority and the main political decisions should be made by them. The time for the Jewish political redemption has not yet arrived. Accordingly, Jews in Palestine should focus more on the religious aspects of life, which are the real source of their legitimate rights in the Land of Israel. Highly sensitive political decisions such as the question of land ownership and the Western Wall should be postponed to the future.

Eldad Brin

Improving Their Housing and Minding the Frontier: "Tenements for Evacuees"
in pre-1967 Israeli Jerusalem as a Unique Case of Security Settlement

Early-statehood Israel, and Jerusalem especially, were plagued by substandard housing, tens of thousands of families living in crowded, dilapidated, and often dangerous houses and apartments and receiving little if any governmental or municipal assistance. Alleviating their distress were improvised and inconsistent solutions, offered on an inadequate scope. However, pressing this issue was, the state and city housing authorities did not prioritize it until the late 1950s, when dedicated construction companies began to construct purpose-built tenements for evacuees, mostly in the country's three major cities. Uniquely in Jerusalem, which was then divided between Israel and the Kingdom of Jordan along a volatile armistice line, some of these tenements assured a significant, permanent civilian presence along the

porous frontier as well as—given their height and preconceived design—improved shooting and scoping positions for the army. Civilian *raison d’etre* of these buildings, improving living conditions for over a thousand families, was thus compounded—indeed, superseded—by military considerations, making the tenements a localized version of pre-independence and early-statehood outpost settlements.

Arnon Golan

Shlomo Lahat’s Election in 1973 as Mayor of Tel Aviv: A Harbinger of the National Upheaval of 1977?

Research into Israel’s 1977 political *mahapakh* (upheaval), in which the hegemonic Labor Alignment (a coalition Israel’s major socialist party and its associates) was toppled by the right-wing Likud Party, deals mainly with the national level and rarely considers the effects of local politics on the electoral upset. The most prominent event in the municipal context was the 1973 elections for the City Council of Tel Aviv, Israel’s main metropolis. In this contest, the Alignment’s local list, headed by the incumbent Mayor Yehoshua Rabinovich, was defeated by the Likud candidate, Major General (res.) Shlomo “Cheech” Lahat, who retired from active service in the summer of 1972 and turned to politics. Lahat won the campaign, his victory ending fourteen years of socialist hegemony in the Tel Aviv City Council. In this article, I examine the question of whether Cheech’s victory was the harbinger of the national-level upset or whether it traced to local factors and had a negligible effect on the national level.

Avital Ginat

The Schism in Ha-Kibbutz Ha-Meuhad Movement: Between Tatters of Torn Memory

Although not the first in its history, the split in the Ha-Kibbutz Ha-Meuhad Movement in the early 1950s, known simply as *ha-pilug* (the schism), proved to be the most severe and impactful, signaling the onset of the decline and weakening of the kibbutz movements. Ideological tensions escalated, transforming kibbutzim into battlegrounds where movement leaders and the Mapai Party vied for control, leaving the members to suffer the consequences. In this study, I scrutinize the enduring repercussions of this schism, widely perceived as so violent as to tear families apart. I ask whether the schism was instigated by political motives or if it arose from broader crises during Israel’s formative years. The existing literature on the topic, largely authored by movement leaders and key activists, seeks to retrospectively justify the schism, contrasting with the firsthand experiences and reflections that members expressed in letters and articles. Traumatized by the split, members remained reticent, their turmoil revealed through archival materials. Their silence appears to be less the

fear of reopening wounds and more an inability to justify a process from which they felt disconnected. The involvement of Ha-Kibbutz Ha-Meuhad and Mapai leaders underscores the political significance of the kibbutz, contrasting with the detachment of most members, who abstained from pivotal decision-making meetings. The interplay between history and memory reveals a generational conflict, the founders perceiving the rift differently from younger generations, who in turn view it as a rash and illogical decision emblematic of a turbulent era. Against the backdrop of tarnished reputations and economic repercussions, attempts to cope with the incident vary from erasing the split entirely to justifying it.

Oded Peled

Between the Personal and the Political: Dr. Israel Eldad and the Leadership of Menachem Begin and David Ben-Gurion

The Herut Movement under the leadership of Menachem Begin, and the Sulam group headed by Dr. Israel Eldad, were the two Revisionist political entities that vied continually in the Israeli political arena after statehood was achieved. Each represented the ideological legacy of Ze'ev Jabotinsky in its own way and style and each presented itself as the true successor of the Revisionist approach. Neither the common ideological basis that Herut and Sulam shared, nor their opposition to Mapai's rule, nor the close and longstanding personal relationship between Israel Eldad (Scheib) and Menachem Begin led to cooperation between the parties; instead it caused deep rivalry and ongoing ideological, political, and personal conflicts between them. The relationship between Eldad and Begin began when they both belonged to Beitar Poland on the eve of World War II. Their ties tightened when they escaped together to the USSR after the Nazi occupation and until Begin's arrest by the Soviets in September 1940. Their disputes traced to Eldad's participation in the Lehi leadership and Begin's arrival in Mandatory Palestine in May 1942 as a soldier in General Władysław Anders's Polish Army. Begin refused to join Lehi and instead became commander-in-chief of the Irgun. During those years, Eldad discovered, so he claimed, Begin's personal shortcomings and lack of leadership, especially in the Altalena affair. These alleged deficiencies served as a basis for harsh criticism by Eldad and Sulam against Begin and Herut for their failure to provide a political alternative to the hegemony of Mapai and Ben-Gurion. This criticism also created significant conflicts between the parties around issues related to the nature of government of the state and its legal system. The extreme positions that Sulam members expressed on these issues expressed their desire to maintain illegal patterns in their political activities. Conversely, although Prime Minister David Ben-Gurion was a tough ideological opponent of the Revisionist camp and initiated harsh moves against it (such as the *Saison* period and the Altalena affair), his courageous leadership and national achievements prompted Eldad to examine his era from a new perspective and re-evaluate his own doings.

Yoram Fried

The Mixed Armistice Commissions and the Demarcation of Israel's Ceasefire Lines after the War of Independence

In this article, based mainly on the minutes and correspondence of the armistice commissions, I present the central role of the IDF officers who staffed these commissions in marking the ceasefire lines between Israel and its Arab neighbors after the War of Independence. Unlike prior studies that emphasized the geographical and historical aspects of the matter, this research focuses on the commissions' pivotal role in the management of negotiations between the Israeli delegation and its Jordanian counterpart, mediated by UN observers. These commissions, established in 1949 following the armistice agreements between Israel and the Arab countries, were the sole official body that maintained direct and continuous contact with representatives of the neighboring Arab countries and was the only body authorized to discuss the implementation of the agreements. With regard to the demarcation of the ceasefire lines, the armistice agreements had to be "translated" on the basis of geographical and settlement realities on the ground. This process was often accompanied by disputes and disagreements as to the exact location of the line, which required the IDF members of the Israeli delegation to negotiate with the Arab representatives. In the current study, I examine three cases: the attempt to divide the area "between the lines" around the Government House in Jerusalem, the effort to partition the no-man's-land at Latrun, and the attempt to close a gap in the demarcation line near the village of Qattana.

Elad Neemani

The Path to a Military Academy: The Establishment of the Military Academy at Reali High School in Haifa as a Unique Military-Civilian Model

In this article, I deal with the processes surrounding the establishment of the military academy at Reali High School in Haifa as an institution for the training of military elite. In 1953, the academy was founded as a unique military-civilian model in Israel and worldwide. Its creation, predicated on a model in which the military and civilian components existed side-by-side despite many disadvantages for the military, stemmed from the failure of the IDF's plan to install military majors in most of the high schools. The program fell through due to opposition from the Ministry of Education and members of civil society that barred the IDF from the civilian education system and led, as a last resort for the military, to the choice of a civilian model, much more open than the typical military academies around the world.

Yoav Gelber

Was it Possible to Prevent the 1973 War?

In this article, I explore an assertion that some scholars have made—one that has spread among wider circles of public opinion—that Egypt made peace propositions to Israel twice: in early 1971 and in early 1973. Had Israel accepted either of them, it is argued, it could have avoided the Yom Kippur War and instead have concluded a peace treaty with Egypt identical or similar to the one signed in 1979—thus making the Yom Kippur War one of choice and not of necessity. Basing myself mainly on extensive American and Egyptian archival and other types of source material, my conclusion is that the Egyptian proposal is a legend that was submitted neither to Israel nor even to the United States. The so-called Sadat initiative of early 1971, ostensibly aiming for a partial or interim settlement, was a deception meant to spare the Egyptian Army from the heavy losses that it would incur by crossing the Suez Canal in the event of war. The Egyptian-American dialogue in 1973, which actually began at Sadat's initiative in April 1972 and gathered momentum after the expulsion of the Soviet troops from Egypt that summer, was anything but a peace proposal. The Egyptians aimed to negotiate with the Americans, not with Israel. Hafiz Isma'il presented Egypt's known position on a general settlement and hoped to convince the Americans to impose it on Israel. Kissinger did not forward any so-called proposal to Israel; instead, the Americans insisted on additional Egyptian concessions before delivering anything. Sadat refused and the contacts were broken until the war. The Egyptian position presented to the Americans in February 1973 was far different from the peace treaty signed at the White House in 1979, and actually spoke about a return to the pre-1967 armistice regime.